

## 2012 Draft LTCP Project Re-Assessment

**2012 Level of Control**

\*\* Level of Control Changed from 2009 to 2012 Analysis

Project Name	Receiving Stream	CSO Controlled	2009 LTCP LOC (Overflows per Year)	2009 LTCP Size (MG)	2009 LTCP Cost	0 Overflows/YR		2 Overflows/YR		4 Overflows/YR		8 Overflows/YR		2012 Re-assessment Size (MG)	2012 LTCP/Re-assessment Cost	Cost Difference		Completion Date	Proposed Completion Date	Explanation for Proposed Schedule Revisions
						Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost			Re-assessment Cost vs. LTCP Cost				
I-64 and Grinstead Drive Storage Basin**	Middle Fork	CSO125, CSO126, CSO127, CSO166	8	2.74	\$12,950,000	22.45	18.39	17.46	17.71	15.13	19.9	12.46	19.44	15.13	\$48,970,000	\$36,020,000	12/31/2014	12/31/2020	Public comments received requested serious consideration for green infrastructure utilization in the basin drainage area along with intensive public involvement. Due to the size of the drainage area and the increased size and cost of the basin, additional time is needed to address this project appropriately.	
Story Avenue and Main Street Storage Basin	Ohio River	CSO020	8	0.13	\$1,580,000	16.58	12.28	9.79	14.74	7.12	19.4	5.42	21.6	5.42	\$12,580,000	\$11,000,000	12/31/2013	12/31/2020	Story and Main & 13th and Rowan basins are linked together functionally. Story & Main grew substantially in size due to more conservative operational assumptions for Starkey PS. MSD proposes to split out and accelerate the schedule of CRD/CSO 22/CSO 23/CSO054 projects using green infrastructure and localized storage. Additional time is requested to right size the Story/Main and 13th/Rowan basins once the impacts of green infrastructure and upstream storage are realized and monitored.	
13th Street and Rowan Street Storage Basin**	Ohio River	CSO050, CSO051, CSO052, CSO053, CSO054, CSO055, CSO056, CSO150, CSO155	4	14.44	\$49,680,000	35.15	25.7	11.14	39.46	8.48	46	5	48.26	5	\$19,870,000	(\$29,810,000)	12/31/2020	12/31/2020	MSD proposes to split CRD/CSO 22/CSO 23 projects into separate projects and move them up in schedule. The storage basin is proposed to remain on the same schedule.	
CRD CSO Green Infrastructure & Localized Storage**	Ohio River	Central Relief Drain CSOs (8 total with an AAOV)	4											1.07 MG (combined)	\$5,216,250	\$5,216,250	Staggered deadlines from 2014 to 2020 - TBD		New project. MSD proposes to split CRD/CSO 22/CSO 23/CSO054 projects into separate projects and move them up in schedule. The storage basin is proposed to remain on the same schedule.	
CSO022, CSO023 & CSO054 Green Infrastructure & Localized Storage **	Ohio River	CSO022, CSO023, CSO054	4											1.20 MG	\$3,774,000	\$3,774,000	2017		New project. MSD proposes to split CRD/CSO 22/CSO 23/CSO054 projects into separate projects and move them up in schedule. The storage basin is proposed to remain on the same schedule.	
Lexington Road and Payne Street Storage Basin**	South Fork	CSO084, CSO118, CSO119, CSO120, CSO121, CSO141, CSO153, CSO082	8	7.31	\$25,200,000	8.18	75.16	6.73	65.1	5.95	70.2	4.03	73.09	8.18	\$25,900,000	\$700,000	12/31/2020	12/31/2020	No changes are proposed for this project schedule.	
Portland Wharf Storage Basin	Ohio River	CSO019	8	6.37	\$20,000,000	2.98	29.55	2.01	30.04	1.41	33.5	0.97	27.42	1.14	\$10,330,000	(\$9,670,000)	12/31/2019	12/31/2019	No changes are proposed for this project schedule.	

## 2012 Draft LTCP Project Re-Assessment

**2012 Level of Control**

\*\* Level of Control Changed from 2009 to 2012 Analysis

Project Name	Receiving Stream	CSO Controlled	2009 LTCP LOC (Overflows per Year)	2009 LTCP Size (MG)	2009 LTCP Cost	0 Overflows/YR		2 Overflows/YR		4 Overflows/YR		8 Overflows/YR		2012 Re-assessment Size (MG)	2012 LTCP/Re-assessment Cost	Cost Difference		Completion Date	Proposed Completion Date	Explanation for Proposed Schedule Revisions	
						Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost			Re-assessment Cost vs. LTCP Cost					
Logan Street and Breckinridge Street – Calvary Cemetery Storage Basin	South Fork	CSO137, CSO106, CSO097, CSO110, CSO148, CSO111, CSO151, CSO113, CSO152, CSO091, CSO146, CSO149, CSO117	8	Logan – 11.83	Logan - \$30,320,000	34.2	50.29	26.71	53.25	20.96	60.5	16.6	61.19	16.6	\$48,240,000	\$4,200,000	12/31/2017	12/31/2017	A review of project approach and benefit/cost results eliminated the Calvary Creekside basin, consolidating storage to the Logan Street basin location. No changes to schedule are proposed.		
				Calvary – 3.46	Calvary - \$13,720,000																Basin volume now addressed through Logan Street. Project is proposed to be eliminated.
				Combined – 15.29	Combined - \$44,040,000																
Nightingale Pump Station Replacement & Storage**	South Fork	CSO018	NA	60 MGD/0 MG	\$15,710,000	33 MGD/0.26 MG	14.8	33 MGD/0.11 MG	10.4	33 MGD/0.01 MG	11	33 MGD/NA	NA	33 MGD/0.26 MG	\$9,563,000	(\$6,147,000)	12/31/2016	12/31/2015	MSD proposed to move this project up in schedule due to operational advantages that would be realized.		
Algonquin Parkway Storage Basin/In-line Storage	Ohio River	CSO016, CSO210, CSO211	8	4.84	\$17,300,000	12.66	52.93	7.82	56.07	0.81	78.6	0	116.37	0 (In-line storage only)	\$0	(\$17,300,000)	12/31/2018	Eliminated	Offline storage eliminated. Optimized operating rules between Paddy's Run HRT and Morris Forman's Main Diversion Structure demonstrated that only inline storage was needed at Southern Outfall Relief 1 and Southern Outfall Relief 2. MSD proposes to move the first of these two pieces up in schedule, the second piece back in schedule one year and eliminate the Algonquin storage basin portion of the project.		
SOR1	Ohio River	CSO016/210	8	NA	NA	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0 (In-line storage only)	\$3,544,000	\$3,544,000	12/31/2018	2015	New stand-alone project. Optimized operating rules between Paddy's Run HRT and Morris Forman's Main Diversion Structure demonstrated that only inline storage was needed at Southern Outfall Relief 1 and Southern Outfall Relief 2. MSD proposes to move the first of these two pieces up in schedule, the second piece back in schedule one year and eliminate the Algonquin storage basin portion of the project.		
SOR2	Ohio River	CSO211	8	NA	NA	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0 (In-line storage only)	\$3,544,000	\$3,544,000	12/31/2018	2018	New stand-alone project. Optimized operating rules between Paddy's Run HRT and Morris Forman's Main Diversion Structure demonstrated that only inline storage was needed at Southern Outfall Relief 1 and Southern Outfall Relief 2. MSD proposes to move the first of these two pieces up in schedule, the second piece back in schedule one year and eliminate the Algonquin storage basin portion of the project.		

## 2012 Draft LTCP Project Re-Assessment

**2012 Level of Control**

\*\* Level of Control Changed from 2009 to 2012 Analysis

Project Name	Receiving Stream	CSO Controlled	2009 LTCP LOC (Overflows per Year)	2009 LTCP Size (MG)	2009 LTCP Cost	0 Overflows/YR		2 Overflows/YR		4 Overflows/YR		8 Overflows/YR		2012 Re-assessment Size (MG)	2012 LTCP/Re-assessment Cost	Cost Difference		Completion Date	Proposed Completion Date	Explanation for Proposed Schedule Revisions
						Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost	Size (MG) or Rate (mgd)	Present Worth Benefit-Cost			Re-assessment Cost vs. LTCP Cost				
Paddy's Run RTB	Ohio River	CSO015, CSO191	8	50 MGD	\$24,940,000	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	50 MGD/ 18 MG Storage	TBD	TBD		12/31/2014	12/31/2017	Optimization w flow through Morris Forman's Main Diversion Structure and MSD's Real Time Control strategy added storage volume requirements. Additional time for construction is being requested due to size increase, moving the site, offline storage and integration of Southwestern Pump Station.
Story Avenue and Spring Street Storage Basin	South Fork	CSO130	8	0.01	\$1,077,000	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	NA (Green Projects)	NA	\$0		12/31/2016	12/31/2014	A project modification request to use a suite of green infrastructure projects in lieu of the storage basin is anticipated in early 2012. No schedule change for overflow reduction is anticipated.
Southwestern Parkway Storage Basin	Ohio River	CSO104, CSO105, CSO189	0	5.08	\$17,620,000	11.07	24.06	8.39	22.54	6.99	22.6	5.08	19.41	11.07	\$30,940,000	\$13,320,000		12/31/2018	12/31/2018	No changes are proposed for this project schedule.
Clifton Heights Storage Basin	Muddy Fork	CSO132, CSO154, CSO167	8	6.55	\$13,870,000	6.68	55.38	6.23	46.76	4.63	54.2	3.28	61.26	3.28	\$8,025,000	(\$5,845,000)		12/31/2018	12/31/2018	No changes are proposed for this project schedule.
18th and Northwestern Pkwy Storage Basin	Ohio River	CSO190	8	1.31	\$4,514,000	2.06	53.14	1.88	47.22	1.76	49.1	1.24	55.57	1.24	\$4,377,000	(\$137,000)		12/31/2017	12/31/2017	No changes are proposed for this project schedule.
Adams Street Storage Basin (Revised to Sewer Separation)**	Ohio River	CSO172	8	0.12	\$983,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0	\$73,700	(\$909,300)		12/31/2012	12/31/2012	Project modification request to revise this project to a sewer separation has been submitted and accepted. Upon inspection of the sewer system, all but two catch basins were found to have been separated already during recent redevelopment.
CSO108 Dam Modification	South Fork	CSO108	NA	-	\$150,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	NA	\$150,000	\$0		12/31/2010	12/31/2010	Completed
CSO123 Downspout Disconnection	Middle Fork	CSO123	NA	-	\$315,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	NA	\$315,000	\$0		12/31/2012	12/31/2012	Considering the use of green infrastructure and localized storage for this area.
CSO206 Sewer Separation	Middle Fork	CSO206	NA	-	\$3,842,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	NA	\$3,842,000	\$0		12/31/2013	12/31/2013	No Change
CSO058 Sewer Separation	Ohio River	CSO058	NA	-	\$1,361,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	NA	\$1,361,000	\$0		12/31/2014	12/31/2014	Considering the use of green infrastructure and localized storage for this area.
CSO140 Sewer Separation	Middle Fork	CSO140	NA	-	\$3,150,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	NA	\$3,150,000	\$0		12/31/2015	12/31/2015	Considering the use of green infrastructure and localized storage for this area.
CSO093 Sewer Separation	South Fork	CSO093	NA	-	\$952,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	NA	\$952,000	\$0		12/31/2015	12/31/2015	Considering the use of green infrastructure and localized storage for this area.
CSO160 Sewer Separation	Ohio River	CSO160	NA	-	\$237,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	NA	\$237,000	\$0		12/31/2015	12/31/2015	Considering the use of green infrastructure and localized storage for this area.
															\$241,111,950	\$11,499,950				